Division III Reporter Review: Global Dynamics

M.Wiltberger NCAR/HAO



Task and Scope

- Provide a review of the literature related to modeling the interaction of the magnetosphere-ionosphere system with the solar wind on a global scale
- Scope
 - Only included peer reviewed publications in major journals, e.g. JGR, GRL, SW, AG, JASTP, from 7/09 to 6/11
 - Reporting content of papers not providing any scientific assessment
 - Papers must have a global modeling as a significant component
 - Only 40 minutes so the coverage is not comprehensive
 - Apologies to papers I may have had to skip for time

Broad Topic Areas I

- Substorms
 - Efforts to model the onset and evolution of substorms
- Ionospheric Outflow modeling
 - Developments related to modeling with more than one fluid including ionospheric outflow
- Other IMF Directions
 - Using models to look at system for IMF directions besides B_Z
- Polar Cap Potential Saturation
 - Modeling efforts to understand the nonlinear saturation of the polar cap potential
- Interlude
 - A brief break of global simulations

Broad Topic Areas II

- Dayside Reconnection
 - Structure and dynamics of the magnetic reconnection process on the dayside especially FTEs
- Waves
 - Using global models to study the structure and distribution of waves in the magnetosphere
- Validation and Verification
 - Studies assessing the accuracy of global models
- Miscellaneous
 - Papers that didn't fit, but had neat ideas

Substorms

- Tanaka et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used his global MHD model
 - Examined the structure and evolution of the current systems for an idealized event
 - Substorm current wedge formed at onset
 - Shows complicated interaction of current systems



- Harnett et al., JGR, 2008
 - Used the Winglee Multifluild model
 - Examined initiation of substorm on 26 Feb 2008
 - State that arrival of heavy ions in magnetotail leads to substorm onset
 - Fast flows link reconnection and aurora
 - Onset in simulation precedes THEMIS
 observations



Substorms II



- Ashour-Abdalla et al., JGR, 2009
 - Used the UCLA Model + LSK
 - Examined particle motions in MHD fields for substorm on 1 Mar 2008
 - Acceleration mostly occurred in regions with large electric fields and nonadiabatic motion
 - Prior to onset contribution to cross tail current from ionospheric sources

- El Alaoui et al., JGR, 2009
 - Used the UCLA Model
 - Compared results to THEMIS observations for substorm on 1 Mar 2008
 - Complex dynamics in magnetotail
 - Reconnection prior to onset on closed field lines
 - Vorticies near P3 and P4
 - Multiple NL merging to for single NL



Substorms III



- Ge et al., JGR, 2011
 - Used the OpenGGCM Model
 - Event study of 27 Feb 2009 substorm onset
 - Auroral breakup caused by vortices at edge of BBFs
 - Examines relationship between DF structures and multiple X lines in simulation

- Farr et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used the LFM model
 - Focused on the recovery phase of the substorm by simulating 7 different substorm intervals
 - Saw evidence in simulation for retreat of tail reconnection line to conditions in the solar wind



Substorm IV



- Ashour-Abdalla et al., Nature Physics, 2011
 - Used the UCLA Model + LSK
 - Examined particle motions in MHD fields for substorm on 15 Feb 2008
 - Particle energization is associated with both magnetic reconnection and with betatron acceleration

Ionospheric Outflow Modeling

 \bullet

- Glocer et al., JGR, 2009
 - Used the SWMF
 - Adds a Polar Wind Outflow Model (PWOM)
 - Event studies for two geomagnetic storms
 - Multispecies MHD is used track the evolution and impact of O+
 - Reduces RMS error of GOES magnetic field comparison by 50%





- Welling et al., JGR, 2009
 - Used the SWMF and PWOM
 - Adds RCM-SCB Ring current model
 - Examined how outflow effects ring current
 - Reductions in convection electric field
 - Non trivial local time dependencies

Ionospheric Outflow Modeling II

- Wiltberger et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used the MFLFM MHD model
 - Specified O+ outflow from cusp after southward turning of IMF
 - Without Outflow only one substorm
 - Outflow can cause second substorm
 - Depends on speed and intensity of outflow parameters





- Brambles et al., Science, 2011
 - Used the MFLFM model
 - Outflow parameterized using Strangeway Relationships

Simulation produces sawtooth events for steady driving conditions

• Makes prediction for relationship between peroid and outflow flux

Other IMF Directions I

- Peng et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used Chinese PPMLR-MHD Model
 - Looked at affects of IMF Bx
 - Shifts MP location direction depends on sign
 - Shifts merging line location when combined with southward IMF
 - MP reconnection rate decreases with increasing IMF Bx





Mitchell et al., JGR, 2010

- Used the LFM model
 - Examined polar cap potential saturation during conditions with IMF By
 - Saturation is seen at smaller values of potential, but similar magnitude of IMF
 - Presents supporting data from DMSP observations

Other IMF Directions II

- Watanabe et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used BATSRUS Global MHD Model
 - Looked at combination of IMF $\rm B_{\rm Y}$ and dipole tilt effects
 - Viscous cell centers rotate eastward in NH as tilt increases
 - Round/crescent cell pattern in ionosphere with large distortion of Dungey-type merging cell is also seen





Mitchell et al., JGR, 2010

- Used the LFM model
- Examined polar cap potential saturation during conditions with IMF By
 - Saturation is seen at smaller values of potential, but similar magnitude of IMF
- Presents supporting data from DMSP observations

Polar Cap Potential Saturation

- Lopez et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used the LFM model
 - Argues that saturation of potential is due to change in geoeffective length of merging region
 - At low $|\mathbf{B}|$ flow controlled by ∇P
 - At high |B| flow controlled by $\vec{j} \times \vec{B}$





- Fukazawa et al., JASTP, 2010
 - Used the Ogino MHD model
 - Replaced ionosphere coupling with empirical model
 - Notes a change in flow characteristics around subsolar point for high IMF
 - Notes a difference between increases in speed and $|\mathbf{B}|$ when looking at $\mathbf{E}_{\mathbf{Y}}$

Ignoble Award Break



- Global simulation efforts have been accused of pushing the envelope for applying techniques to simulation the system
- Tero et al. 2010 built a simulation of Tokyo rail system built on modeling slime mold for which they recived an Ignoble Award

Dayside Reconnection

- Hu et al., JGR, 2009
 - Used Chinese PPMLR-MHD Model
 - Developed technique for defining merging region in 3D
 - Combine min B, last closed and selected closed field lines
 - Calc E field along this region
 - Reconnection voltage and ionospheric voltage are not the same





- Park et al., GRL, 2009
 - Used Ogino's Global MHD Model
 - Examined dayside reconnection for northward and duskward IMF with positive dipole tilt
 - Electric fields peak in region of anti-parallel magnetic field
 - In contrast to previous results see stronger currents in winter hemisphere

Dayside Reconnection II

- Ouellette et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used the LFM Model
 - Examined IMF from 0° to 180° in 45° steps
 - Found antiparallel reconnection
 - 45° and 90° near cusps
 - 135° and 180° belt across subsolar region
 - Also found guide field reconnection for 45° and 90°





- Pulkkinen et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used the GUMICS MHD model
 - Examined a slowly varying IMF direction
 - Found energy input and response scale with electric field along reconnection line $-E_{PAR}$
 - Response/EPAR is independent of clock angle
 - Illustrate the importance of localized reconnection line on controlling energy input into coupled MI system

Verification and Validation

- Pulkkinen et al., SW, 2011
 - CCMC Comparisons of SWMF, OpenGGCM, and LFM/CMIT
 - Used a variety of metrics to quantitatively asses model performance during 4 different intervals
 - Focused on ground magnetic field perturbations
 - No model uniformly best on all metrics
 - Intra-model variability larger than intermodel variability for some measures





- Rastatter et al., SW, 2011
 - CCMC Comparisons of SWMF, OpenGGCM, and LFM/CMIT
 - Focused on Geosynchronous Magnetic Fields
 - Compared |B|, elevation angle, and spectral power
 - Once again no model best on all metrics
 - Inclusion of inner magnetosphere model improves results

Validation and Verification II

- Zhang et al., JASTP, 2011
 - Used the LFM Model
 - Used LFM "Long Run" Intervals
 - Two months 2/23/96-04/26/96
 - Binned data by IMF direction and compared with Weimer 05 and Iridium
 - Good CPCP pattern, but magnitude high
 - Good agreement with Iridium





Ridley et al., AG, 2010

- Used the BATSRUS
- Under idealzied solar wind conditions examined the effect of numerical scheme, resolution, limter, etc
 - Solutions not grid converged with best solver and highest resolution
 - Boris 'Speed of Light' correction helps
 - Nonlinear interaction between numerical effects

Validation and Verification III

- Ilie et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used the SWMF
 - Averaged SW inputs over 4,60,120, and 180 minutes to examine affects on response of model
 - All parameters affect results by dependence on Bz strongest
 - Greater than 60 minute avg reduces plasma sheet density and pressure
 - Nonlinear dependence with threshold condition





- Palmroth et al., AG, 2011
 - Used the GUMICS model
 - Comparison Cluster observations during magnetopause crossings for two events
 - Good spatial agreement, but GUMICS is 30% weaker
 - Scaling ε with MP area indicates that it may significantly underestimate energy input

Waves I

- Claudepierre et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used the LFM Model
 - Placed ULF dynamic pressure fluctuations in SW driver
 - Monochoromatic SW fluctuations drive toroidal mode FLRs where eigenfreq matches driving
 - Continuum driving drives spectrum of FLRs





- Hu et al., JGR, 2010
 - Hybrid simulation EMIC waves in a multi-ion plasma in a dipole
 - Start in MHD equilibrium
 - Generate waves at the equator
 - Waves become polarized as they propagate to higher latitudes
 - Importance of wave particle interactions depend heavily on density

Waves II

- Huang et al., JGR, 2010a,b
 - Used the LFM Model
 - Compared results from 27 days simualtion with statistical results from 9 years of GOES obs
 - LFM does a good job producing statistcal chararistics of wave power
 - Provides wave field data needed to model radiation electrons



Misc - Hybrid Simulations

- Peng et al., JGR, 2011 and Tan et al. JGR 2010
 - Newly developed 3D Global Hybrid Model
 - Examined dayside reconnection during southward IMF
 - Multiple X lines form with FTEs consistent with satellite observations
 - Examined passage of TD in solar wind
 - Thin TD lead to flux ropes in magnetosheath
 - SN TD could contribute to boundary layer





- Omidi et al., JGR, 2011
 - Used 2.5D Hybrid Simulation
 - Observed the formation of a new feature called 'Foreshock bubbles' during passage of SW discontinuities
 - Leading edge has fast shock
 - Core contains hotter less dense plasma with lower |B|
 - Impacts affect plasma injection into cusp

Miscellaneous - BBFs and DFs

- Yang et al., JGR, 2011
 - Used the RCM-E
 - Examined the structure of BBF for an idealized substorm with localized bubble
 - Injection boundary coincident with Earthward edge of bubble
 - Suggest that bubble are core part of particle injections





- Birn et al., JGR, 2011
 - Used 3D MHD Magnetotail Simulation
 - Examined flow of bubble created by magnetic reconnection in tail
 - General characteristics in agreement with THEMIS
 - Initial Phase is earthward prop DF
 - When stopped expands azimuthally and tailward
 - Vortices present outside many flow

Miscellaneous - Boundary

- Guo et al., JGR, 2011
 - Used Chinese PPMLR-MHD Model
 - Found standing shock waves in the magnetosheath
 - Occur at mid- and high latitude
 - Can lead to distortions in shape of BS
 - SSW are excited by indentations on magnetopause





Guo et al., JGR, 2010

- Used Chinese PPMLR-MHD Model
- Examined fomation of KH at MP during northward IMF
- KH vortices generate on dayside are transported to far distant magnetotail
 - Generates at 28° off Sun-Earth line
 - Wavelengths vary 1 to 8 R_E
 - Confined to 30° of equatorial plane

Miscellaneous - Propagation

- Pulkkinen et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used GUMICS MHD model
 - Clear, repeatable delay between changes in SW and energy input through MP
 - JH responds promptly energy input
 - AE response delayed for increase
 - AE response prompt for decrease





- Andreeova et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used the GUMICS MHD Model
 - Examined coupling efficiency in response to dynamic pressure changes
 - Higher speed has higher ionospheric activity
 - Efficiency is highest for small values of $\rm E_{\rm Y}$
 - Driving independent of reconnection E

Miscellaneous – MI Coupling

- Tang et al., JGR, 2011
 - Used Chinese PPMLR-MHD Model
 - Examine the effects of ionospheric conductance on westward electrojet
 - For low conductance two cell pattern
 - For $\Sigma_{\rm H} / \Sigma_{\rm P} > 2$ intense electrojet
 - Electrojet is cowling current driven by the southward E due to current closure in plasma sheet





- Yu et al., JGR, 2010
 - Used the SWMF
 - Extended physics for calculating ground magnetic field perturbations to include FAC in gap region
 - Most important for Northward perturbations
 - Largest effect during storm main phase

Conclusions

- Global scale simulations have been used to examine a wide range of scientific questions
 - Efforts continue to verify and validate the results coming from these simulations
 - Providing insight on the behavior of the system under a vast array of conditions
 - Continuing success in modeling substorms
 - A useful tool in the study of 3D reconnection
- CCMC is broadening the utilization of global models
 - Conducting essential inter-model comparisons
 - Not a model developer, so continued support to the development community is needed

- Alaoui El M, Ashour-Abdalla M, Walker RJ, Peroomian V, Richard RL, et al. (2009) Substorm evolution as revealed by THEMIS satellites and a global MHD simulation. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 114: A08221. doi: 10.1029/2009JA014133
- Ashour-Abdalla M, Bosqued JM, Alaoui El M, Peroomian V, Zhou M, et al. (2009) A simulation study of particle energization observed by THEMIS spacecraft during a substorm. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 114: A09204. doi: 10.1029/2009JA014126
- Ashour-Abdalla M, Alaoui El M, Goldstein M~, Zhou M, Schriver D, et al. (2011) Observations and simulations of non-local acceleration of electrons in magnetotail magnetic reconnection events. Nature Physics 7: 360–365. doi:10.1038/nphys1903
- Brambles OJ, Lotko W, Zhang B, Wiltberger M, Lyon J, et al. (2011) Magnetosphere Sawtooth Oscillations Induced by Ionospheric Outflow. Science 332: 1183–1186. doi: 10.1126/science.1202869
- Birn J, Nakamura R, Panov E~, Hesse M (2011) Bursty bulk flows and dipolarization in MHD simulations of magnetotail reconnection. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 116: A01210. doi:10.1029/2010JA016083
- Claudepierre SG, Hudson MK, Lotko W, Lyon JG, Denton R~ (2010) Solar wind driving of magnetospheric ULF waves: Field line resonances driven by dynamic pressure fluctuations. arXiv 115: A11202. doi:10.1029/2010JA015399

- Farr NL, Baker DN, Wiltberger M (2010) Using a global magnetohydrodynamic model to study the start of the substorm recovery phase. J. Geophys. Res 115: 12237. doi: 10.1029/2010JA015802
- Fukazawa K, Aoyama T, Ogino T, Yumoto K (2010) Response of the reconnection electric field and polar cap potential to the IMF and velocity of solar wind. Journal of Atmospheric and Solar-Terrestrial Physics 72: 1019–1023. doi:10.1016/j.jastp. 2010.06.002
- Ge Y~, Raeder J, Angelopoulos V, Gilson M~, Runov A (2011) Interaction of dipolarization fronts within multiple bursty bulk flows in global MHD simulations of a substorm on 27 February 2009. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 116: A00I23. doi:10.1029/2010JA015758
- Glocer A, Tóth G, Ma Y, Gombosi T, Zhang J, et al. (2009) Multifluid Block-Adaptive-Tree Solar wind Roe-type Upwind Scheme: Magnetospheric composition and dynamics during geomagnetic storms—Initial results. J. Geophys. Res 114: 12203. doi: 10.1029/2009JA014418
- Guo XC, Wang C, Hu YQ (2010) Global MHD simulation of the Kelvin-Helmholtz instability at the magnetopause for northward interplanetary magnetic field. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A10218. doi:10.1029/2009JA015193
- Guo XC, Wang C, Hu YQ (2010) Global MHD simulation of the Kelvin-Helmholtz instability at the magnetopause for northward interplanetary magnetic field. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A10218. doi:10.1029/2009JA015193

- Harnett EM, Winglee RM, Lerud T (2010) Multiscale-multifluid simulations of the 26 February 2008 substorm: Evidence for internal triggering of a substorm. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A12238. doi:10.1029/2010JA015672
- Hu Y, Denton R~, Johnson JR (2010) Two-dimensional hybrid code simulation of electromagnetic ion cyclotron waves of multi-ion plasmas in a dipole magnetic field. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A09218. doi: 10.1029/2009JA015158
- Hu YQ, Peng Z, Wang C, Kan JR (2009) Magnetic merging line and reconnection voltage versus IMF clock angle: Results from global MHD simulations. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 114: A08220. doi:10.1029/2009JA014118
- Huang C-L, Spence HE, Singer HJ, Hughes WJ (2010) Modeling radiation belt radial diffusion in ULF wave fields: 1. Quantifying ULF wave power at geosynchronous orbit in observations and in global MHD model. J. Geophys. Res 115: 06215. doi: 10.1029/2009JA014917
- Huang C-L, Spence HE, Hudson MK, Elkington SR (2010) Modeling radiation belt radial diffusion in ULF wave fields: 2. Estimating rates of radial diffusion using combined MHD and particle codes. J. Geophys. Res 115: 06216. doi: 10.1029/2009JA014918
- Ilie R, Liemohn MW, Ridley A (2010) The effect of smoothed solar wind inputs on global modeling results. J. Geophys. Res 115: 01213. doi:10.1029/2009JA014443

- Lopez RE, Bruntz R, Mitchell EJ, Wiltberger M, Lyon JG, et al. (2010) Role of magnetosheath force balance in regulating the dayside reconnection potential. J. Geophys. Res 115: 12216. doi:10.1029/2009JA014597
- Mitchell EJ, Lopez RE, Bruntz RJ, Wiltberger M, Lyon JG, et al. (2010) Saturation of transpolar potential for large Y component interplanetary magnetic field. J. Geophys. Res 115: 06201. doi:10.1029/2009JA015119
- Omidi N, Eastwood JP, Sibeck DG (2010) Foreshock bubbles and their global magnetospheric impacts. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A06204. doi:10.1029/2009JA014828
- Ouellette JE, Rogers BN, Wiltberger M, Lyon JG (2010) Magnetic reconnection at the dayside magnetopause in global Lyon-Fedder-Mobarry simulations. J. Geophys. Res 115: 08222. doi:10.1029/2009JA014886
- Park K~, Ogino T, Kim Y~ (2010) Effects of the dipole tilt and northward and duskward IMF on dayside magnetic reconnection in a global MHD simulation. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A02208. doi:10.1029/2009JA014212
- Pang Y, Lin Y, Deng X~, Wang XY, Tan B (2010) Three-dimensional hybrid simulation of magnetosheath reconnection under northward and southward interplanetary magnetic field. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A03203. doi: 10.1029/2009JA014415
- Peng Z, Wang C, Hu YQ (2010) Role of IMF B_x in the solar wind-magnetosphereionosphere coupling. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A08224. doi: 10.1029/2010JA015454

- Pulkkinen A, Kuznetsova M, Ridley A, Raeder J, Vapirev A, et al. (2011) Geospace Environment Modeling 2008–2009 Challenge: Ground magnetic field perturbations. Space Weather 9: S02004. doi:10.1029/2010SW000600
- Pulkkinen TI, Palmroth M, Janhunen P, Koskinen HEJ, McComas D~, et al. (2010) Timing of changes in the solar wind energy input in relation to ionospheric response. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A00I09. doi: 10.1029/2010JA015764
- Pulkkinen TI, Palmroth M, Koskinen HEJ, Laitinen TV, Goodrich CC, et al. (2010) Magnetospheric modes and solar wind energy coupling efficiency. J. Geophys. Res 115: 03207. doi:10.1029/2009JA014737
- Rastätter L, Kuznetsova MM, Vapirev A, Ridley A, Wiltberger M, et al. (2011) Geospace Environment Modeling 2008\ndash2009 Challenge: Geosynchronous magnetic field. Space Weather 9: S04005. doi:10.1029/2010SW000617
- Ridley AJ, Gombosi TI, Sokolov IV, Tóth G, Welling DT (2010) Numerical considerations in simulating the global magnetosphere. ANNALES GEOPHYSICAE 28: 1589–1614. doi:10.5194/angeo-28-1589-2010
- Tan B, Lin Y, Perez JD, Wang XY (2011) Global-scale hybrid simulation of dayside magnetic reconnection under southward IMF: Structure and evolution of reconnection. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 116: A02206. doi: 10.1029/2010JA015580

- Tanaka T, Nakamizo A, Yoshikawa A, Fujita S, Shinagawa H, et al. (2010) Substorm convection and current system deduced from the global simulation. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A05220. doi:10.1029/2009JA014676
- Tang B~, Wang C, Hu YQ, Kan JR (2011) Intensification of the Cowling current in the global MHD simulation model. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 116: A06204. doi:10.1029/2010JA016320
- Watanabe M, Kabin K, Sofko GJ, Rankin R, Gombosi TI, et al. (2010) Dipole tilt effects on the magnetosphere-ionosphere convection system during interplanetary magnetic field B_Y-dominated periods: MHD modeling. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 115: A07218. doi:10.1029/2009JA014910
- Welling DT, Jordanova V~, Zaharia S~, Glocer A, Tóth G (2011) The effects of dynamic ionospheric outflow on the ring current. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 116: A00J19. doi:10.1029/2010JA015642
- Wiltberger M, Lotko W, Lyon JG, Damiano P, Merkin V (2010) Influence of cusp O+ outflow on magnetotail dynamics in a multifluid MHD model of the magnetosphere. J. Geophys. Res 115. doi:10.1029/2010JA015579
- Yang J, Toffoletto FR, Wolf RA, Sazykin S (2011) RCM-E simulation of ion acceleration during an idealized plasma sheet bubble injection. Journal of Geophysical Research Space Physics 116: A05207. doi:10.1029/2010JA016346

- Yu Y, Ridley AJ, Welling DT, Tóth G (2010) Including gap region field-aligned currents and magnetospheric currents in the MHD calculation of ground-based magnetic field perturbations. J. Geophys. Res 115: 08207. doi:10.1029/2009JA014869
- Zhang B, Lotko W, Wiltberger MJ, Brambles OJ, Damiano PA (2011) A statistical study of magnetosphere–ionosphere coupling in the Lyon–Fedder–Mobarry global MHD model. Journal of Atmospheric and Solar-Terrestrial Physics 73: 686. doi:10.1016/j.jastp.2010.09.027