

Challenges in Understanding Plasma Entry and Transport

Thanks to discussions at the PET09 workshop in Fairbanks and contributions to the JGR special section on entropy





The Plasma Sheet





Why study the plasma sheet?

Transport of solar wind mass, momentum, and energy across the magnetopause drives magnetospheric dynamics







— Nightside magnetopause

current

Plasma

mantle

Plasma sheet boundary laver current



Plasma sheet serves as a reservoir for plasma transport into the inner magnetosphere which determines the geoeffectiveness of storms and substorms



Geoeffectiveness of CDPS







Basic Magnetopause Processes

Magnetic reconnection (Dungey, 1961)



Viscous interaction (Axford and Hines, 1961)

- Diffusion (Micro-instabilities, turbulence)
- Kelvin-Helmholtz instability



(Impulsive penetration (Lemaire and Roth, 1978))



Plasma Sheet Morphology Depends on IMF Direction



Terasawa et al., 1997





Global Plasma Sheet Maps Show IMF Dependence



DMSP remote techniqueIsotropy (large curvature)B field mapping (T89)

Wing and Newell, 2003





Densification takes around 10 hours



Properties inferred from DMSP:

- Rapid decrease of temperature at flank boundaries
- Increase of density first at flanks
- Timescale of density and temperature changes in the midnight meridian ~10 hr
- Asymmetries of the dawn-dusk flanks (distribution, density, temperature)

=> Plasma entry from magnetosheath along the flank boundaries





IMF Dependence and Global MHD







Southward IMF

- Transport dominated by intermittent periods of fast magnetospheric convection (expansion phase or bursty bulk flows)
- Questions:
 - How does the plasma sheet reform after periods of magnetic activity (is IMF By required)?
 - What nonadiabatic processes change entropy from mantle to plasma sheet values?
 - To what extent does steady convection conserve entropy?
 - How does entropy change during fast convection?
 - Why do entry processes conserve T_e/T_i ?





Northward IMF

- Dominated by the formation of a cold, dense plasma sheet with weak convection
- Questions:
 - How and where does plasma enter the plasma sheet (origin of asymmetries)?
 - Why are there distinct hot and cold populations even after long periods of IMF northward?
 - How does entropy change from magnetosheath to plasma sheet and by what mechanism?
 - How does cold material transport to the center of the plasma sheet (convection vs turbulent diffusion)?





What is the origin of the cold population?





Mechanisms of Plasma Entry







Mechanisms of Plasma Entry







Tailward of the Cusp Reconnection

dN/dt~10²⁶-10²⁷ /s



Li et al., 2008

Flank is populated by transient plasma Captured plasma also populates the center of the tail plasma sheet





Observational Support

- Reconnection signatures
 - Bi-directional
 heated electrons
 indicating newly
 closed field lines
 - Magnetopause current layer structure (electron and ion edges)







2006

Lavraud et al.,

Observational Support

- Reconnection signatures
 - Bi-directional heated electrons indicating newly closed field lines
 - Magnetopause current layer structure (electron and ion edges)
- Convection patterns in the lonosphere
- Entry Rate similar to what is required to maintain the plasma sheet 10²⁶-10²⁷ particles/s



Chang et al., 2004





Mechanisms of Plasma Entry







Vorticity in High Resolution MHD Simulations Shows KH modes along the flank









Kelvin-Helmholtz Modes:

Observations (Scopke, Fairfield, Fujimoto, Hasegawa, Nykyri, etc.)

Otto, 2009



Stability:
$$[(\mathbf{V}_1 - \mathbf{V}_2) \cdot \mathbf{k}]^2 > \frac{n_1 + n_2}{4\pi m_0 n_1 n_2} [(\mathbf{B}_1 \cdot \mathbf{k})^2 + (\mathbf{B}_2 \cdot \mathbf{k})^2]$$



Reconnection + KH vortex





(B)







- Strong amplification of the magnetic field in the KH plane.
- Intense current layers in the KH vortex. Current does not neet to be present in the initial

conditions!

Plasma filaments are reconnected and become detached from the high density region!

Nykyri and Otto, 2001, 2003





Ion-scale current sheets at the edge of KH Cluster 2001-11-20 202600-205100 Uortices seen by Cluster 10

C1

C2

C3



Hasegawa et al., 2004 Bsolar wind Bsolar wind Bmagnetosphere Lobe ACE satellite, 230 RE (KH stable) Earth, Plasma Sheet Solar wind (KH unstable) Boundary Layer Subsolar point $\Delta Bx < 0$ ∆Bx>0 Cluster $\Delta B_{\rm V} > 0$ $\Delta Bv < 0$ Magnetopause C4

From 4-SC timing method:

- Vn ~ 80 km/s
- Crossing took ~3 sec.

CS thickness ~250 km = 2-3 times ion inertia length (~100 km)





Reconnection signatures seen by Cluster-3@19 MLT

Mechanisms of Plasma Entry







Alfven waves plays an important role on magnetopause transport



Hybrid Simulations







Transport of Mass, Momentum; Heating







Observational Signatures of KAWs

- Parallel Electron Heating
- Transverse Ion Heating
- Cluster wave observations satisfy KAW dispersion relation [Chaston et al., 2005, 2007, 2008]
- δE/δB ratio
- Diffusion based on measured spectrum D~10¹⁰ m²/s



Chaston et al., 2008





Mechanisms are not Mutually Exclusive



Chaston et al., 2005



Mechanisms are not Mutually Exclusive



Chaston et al., 2007



Distinct populations in the LLBL may result from different entry mechanisms during this MP crossing



Three Distinct Populations Observed at K-H Unstable LLBL



Taylor and Lavraud, 2008

1) Cold population with parallel temperature anisotropy

- may be produced by reconnection in KHI [Nykyri et al., 2006, Nihsino et al, 2007]
- Double high latitude reconnection may also produce similar signature, but is unlikely cause during this interval

3) Cold population with

perpendicular temperature anisotropy

Can be produced by Kinetic Alfven waves [Johnson and Cheng, 2001]

3) A typical hot magnetospheric population

The two cold populations are distinct and may be signatures of different entry mechanisms



Constraints on Plasma Entry

- Dawn-dusk asymmetries
- Phase space density
- Entropy
- Ion to electron temperature ratio





Asymmetries for Northward IMF

Cold plasma is dense along the flanks, hotter and denser on the dawn flank

Hot plasma asymmetry in temperature






Source of the Asymmetry?

• Asymmetries in the magnetosheath?

 Parker spiral effect on transport processes?

Ionospheric conductance?
 Li et al., 2007







Constraints on Plasma Entry

- Dawn-dusk asymmetries
- Phase space density
- Entropy
- Ion to electron temperature ratio





Phase Space Density



Constraints on Plasma Entry

- Dawn-dusk asymmetries
- Phase space density
- Entropy
- Ion to electron temperature ratio





Entropy as a Conserved Quantify

$$S = -\int d^3 \mathbf{x} \int d^3 \mathbf{v} \quad flogf$$

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \frac{\partial f}{\partial \mathbf{x}} + \frac{\mathbf{F}}{m} \cdot \frac{\partial f}{\partial v} = \left(\frac{\partial f}{\partial t}\right)_c$$

$$\frac{dS}{dt} = 0 \qquad \qquad S_0 = -\int f_0 \log f_0$$





Local vs Total Entropy

- Total Entropy: S=kN[3/2 log(T) log(n) + σ_0];
- Entropy density (S/N)
 - $\sigma \sim \log(p/n^{\gamma})$
 - $s = p/n^{\gamma}$ constant if entropy is conserved
- Entropy per unit flux
 - Related to frozen in condition

$$S = \int p^{1/\gamma} ds / B \sim M = \int \rho dV = \int \rho ds / B, \quad \gamma = 5/3$$

• Relation to entropy of the flux tube

$$\Sigma = \int \int \rho \sigma dV = CM \log(S/M)$$





Equation of Energy

$$\frac{\partial n_{\alpha}}{\partial t} + \nabla(n_{\alpha}\vec{v}_{\alpha}) = 0$$

momentum
$$\rho_{\alpha}\frac{d_{\alpha}\vec{v}_{\alpha}}{dt} + \nabla(p_{\alpha}\mathbf{I} + \mathbf{\Pi}_{\alpha}) - \rho_{\alpha}\vec{g} - Q_{\alpha}\vec{E} - \vec{j}_{\alpha} \times \vec{B} = \vec{\mu}_{\alpha}$$

energy
$$\frac{d_{\alpha}p_{\alpha}}{dt} - \gamma_{\alpha}\frac{p_{\alpha}}{\rho_{\alpha}}\frac{d_{\alpha}\rho_{\alpha}}{dt} = (\gamma_{\alpha} - 1)\left\{-\nabla.\vec{\Phi}_{\alpha} - \sum_{l=1}^{3}\sum_{k=1}^{3}\Pi_{\alpha,kl}\frac{\partial v_{l}}{\partial x_{k}} + H_{\alpha}\right\}$$

Heat Flux
$$\vec{\Phi}_{\alpha} = \frac{1}{\alpha}\rho_{\alpha} < u_{\alpha}^{2}\vec{u}_{\alpha} >_{\alpha} = \frac{1}{\alpha}m_{\alpha}\int f_{\alpha} |(\vec{w} - \vec{v}_{\alpha})|^{2} (\vec{w} - \vec{v}_{\alpha})d^{3}\vec{w}$$
(3.9)

Gyroviscosity $\Pi_{\alpha,kl} = P_{\alpha,kl} - p_{\alpha}\delta_{kl}$

$$P_{\alpha,kl} = \rho_{\alpha} < u_{\alpha,k} u_{\alpha,l} >_{\alpha} = \int m_{\alpha} f_{\alpha}(\vec{r},\vec{w},t) (w_k - v_{\alpha,k}) (w_l - v_{\alpha,l}) d^3 \vec{w}$$
(3.3)

Collisional Energy **PPPL** Exchange

$$H_{\alpha} = \int C_{\alpha} \frac{m_{\alpha} u_{\alpha}^2}{2} d^3 \vec{w} \qquad (3.10)$$



Intensive/Extensive Properties of Entropy

- Extensive (Total/Global)
 - $-S=p^{1/\gamma}V$ where V is the flux tube volume
 - Proportional to mass and field-line length
- Intensive (Specific/Local)
 - s=p/ ρ^γ ---the adiabatic pressure law usually assumed in MHD

$$S_1 + S_2 = S_T$$

 $s_1 = s_2 = s_T$
 S_1, s_1
 S_2, s_2



Example of the Extensive/Intensive Properties of Entropy

 Near Earth Plasma Sheet total entropy changes from substorm growth to expansion, but local entropy remains relatively unchanged



Wing and Johnson, 2009





Why Look at Entropy?

- Indicator of organization/stability
- Changes are an indicator of:
 - a nonadiabatic process (wave particle interactions)
 - mass loss from flux tubes
 - heat loss from flux tubes
 - integrity of the fluid element







How Can Entropy Increase in a Collisionless System?





Background Entropy Increases at the Expense of Fluctuations

 $f \equiv f_{\cap} + \delta f$

$$S = -\int f_0 \log f_0 - \int \delta f(1 + \log f_0) - \int \frac{\delta f^2}{f_0}$$
$$\bar{S} = S_0 - \int \frac{\overline{\delta f^2}}{f_0} \leftarrow \text{Time Average}$$





Spatial Structure→Velocity Space Structure

- $\partial f/\partial t + v \partial f/\partial x = 0$
- $x = x_0 + vt$
- f(x,v,0) = g(x,v)
- f(x,v,t) = g(x-vt,v)
- $f_k \sim exp(-ikvt)$
-

 δf>→ 0
- $<(\delta f)^2>$ increases





Kinetic Alfven Waves and Loss of Entropy



- Hot ions ($k_{\perp}\rho_i$ >>1)
 - See small <E>
 - $V_d \sim < E > \times B$ is small
- Cold lons (($k_{\perp}\rho_{I}$ <<1)
 - See large <E>
 - $V_d \sim <E > \times B$ is large
- \Rightarrow shear in velocity

Tatsuno et al., 2009





Entropy for Northward IMF





Entropy in the Magnetosphere

- Significant increase of entropy from sheath to CDPS
- Conservation in the convection direction?



Borovsky, 2005



Northward IMF Entropy Profiles

- Combined entropy has variation mostly in Y
- Hot entropy shows a dawndusk heat flux
- Cold entropy increases by a factor of 5 from flank to midnight in Y direction
- Gradients in PS entropy may reflect entropy changes at the boundary.





Important Questions about Entropy

- Why does the entropy of the nominal hot plasma sheet increase so much relative to the magnetosheath (a factor of 100)?
- Why does the entropy of the cold material increase by a factor of 5-10 or more?
- How does entropy change for hot and cold populations (considered separately?
- How does the combined single fluid (hot + cold) entropy change (note that it can be quite different from the hot and cold components)?
- What changes in entropy are expected for:
 - Tailward of cusp reconnection
 - Reconnection in KH vortices
 - Kinetic Alfven waves





How does cold population entropy change for cusp reconnection?

- Assume that the source population for the cold plasma is from the magnetosheath (much denser than lobe)
- In high beta plasma, expect little increase of entropy due to reconnection at the current layer
- Entropy of the cold population can increase as plasma expands into a reconnected flux tube if it was previously unpopulated with cold plasma
- Free expansion along the flux tube leads to a heat flux and is more likely an isothermal (rather than adiabatic) process
- V_{sh} = flux tube volume between separatrices~volume of sheath plasma captured
- V_{sphere} =flux tube volume between ionosphere and separatrices
- Assuming density becomes constant after a few bounce times, $\rho_{\text{final}} = \rho_{\text{sh}} V_{\text{sh}} / (V_{\text{sh}} + V_{\text{sphere}})$
- $s_f = s_{sh} (1 + V_{sphere} / V_{sh})^{\gamma-1}$
- $\Delta s/s \approx (\gamma 1)(V_{sphere}/V_{sh})$





Cold Population Local Entropy Can Be Increased a small amount by Reconnection



- V=∫ ds/|B|, n=N/V
- $\Delta s/s = (\gamma-1) (V_{sphere}/V_{sh})$
- ∆s/s < 1
- But, the captured plasma cannot increase s very much which implies losses or heating?





Kelvin-Helmholtz can increase the local entropy of the entering cold population significantly

sphere

- In this case much less magnetosheath plasma is captures
- Entropy can increase more

•
$$s_f = s_0 (1 + V_{sphere} / V_{sh})^{\gamma - 1}$$

•
$$s_f >> s_0$$
 if $V_{sphere}/V_{sh} >> 1$

KAWs can increase the local entropy of entering cold plasma

• KAWs lead to heating and diffusion which can increase entropy by order of magnitude





Total Entropy for Cusp Reconnection

- Total flux tube entropy provides a constraint where flux tubes can convect in the tail (single fluid approach)
- Larger total entropy flux tubes could move deeper in the tail (subject to conservation of entropy)
- Consider how the total reconnected flux tube volume depends on component vs antiparallel (near null point) reconnection





Total Entropy H=P^{1/γ}V (considering both hot and cold plasma) has contributions from both the magnetosheath and magnetosphere portions of the field line. When the field line passes through a null the value of H can be larger



If reconnection right at null, then $H = 8 \times 10^4$

Factor of 2

Adamson, 2009





Otto, 2009





Local MHD Simulations show that reconnection leads to field lines being populated by cool magnetosheath and hot magnetospheric plasma with intermediate values of flux tube averaged entropy (includes hot + cold populations in single fluid)



Otto, 2009





Flux Tube Mass and Entropy Mapped to Southern Boundary confirms that field lines that were originally with footpoints in the magnetospheric region become populated with magnetosheath plasma such that the entropy is reduced as a result of mixing of the hot magnetospheric population and cold magnetosheath population (this includes hot+cold populations)



- Average mass transport velocity > 10 km/s
- (Average) Entropy of newly captured plasma average between MSP and MSH values.







Change of Total Entropy

- $S = \int p1/\gamma ds/|B|$
- S is additive
- $\Delta S = S_{sh} S0$
- $\Delta S/S \sim 1/\gamma (\Delta p/p) + (\Delta V/V)$
- $\Delta V/V \approx -\Delta B/B$
- $\Delta p/p = -(2/\beta) (\Delta B/B)$
- $\Delta S/S = -(\Delta B/B) (1 + 2/\beta\gamma)$
- $\Delta S/S = (\Delta p/p)(\beta/2 + 1/\gamma)$
- Negative for Bsh>Bsphere or psh<psphere
- Commonly Observed at MP crossings (related to depletion layer)

$$\left(PV^{5/3}\right)'\left(V'-P'\mu_o\int\frac{ds}{B^3}\right)<0$$

Interchange





MP crossing

- Crossing
 - A: sheath
 - B: LLBL
 - C: Plasma Sheet
- B_{sh} > B_{LLBL,PS}



Phan et al., 1997





MP crossing

- Crossing
 - A: sheath
 - B: LLBL
 - C: Plasma Sheet
- B_{sh} > B_{LLBL}



Entropy Reduction Can lead to Interchange Instability

Once material is injected (low entropy magnetosheath) it becomes interchange unstable and goes inward.





Density and specific entropy









Conclusions on Entropy and the CDPS material

- Local Entropy of cold population
 - Can increase by expansion into the magnetospheric part of the flux tube after reconnection
 - Increases more for KH than for tailward of the cusp reconnection
 - Increases significantly for KAWs
- Local entropy of hot and cold plasma
 - Should decrease on closed field lines by the addition of cold, dense magnetosheath plasma
- Total entropy of the hot and cold plasma
 - Can be larger for antiparallel (near null) reconnection
 - Could decrease when there is reconnection in KH vortices if $B_{sheath} > B_{sphere}$
 - Reduction of entropy would lead to interchange instability





Entropy and the origin of the hot population from reconnection?




Entropy and Reconnection

• MHD and PIC simulations show little change in total entropy ($\beta = 0.2$)







Switch Off Shocks



Priest and Forbes, 2000





Entropy Change at a Slow Shock

Compression:

$$\begin{aligned} X &= \frac{\rho_d}{\rho_u} = 1 + \frac{1}{\gamma\beta + \gamma - 1} \left(1 - \frac{(\gamma\beta - 1)}{\gamma(\beta + 1)} r^2 \right) \\ \frac{p_d}{p_u} &= X \left[1 + \frac{\gamma - 1}{\gamma\beta} \left(1 - r^2 \right) \right] \quad \sim (\beta + 1) / \beta \\ \frac{S_d}{S_u} &= \frac{p_d / p_u}{(\rho_d / \rho_u)^{\gamma}} = X^{1 - \gamma} \left(1 + \frac{\gamma - 1}{\gamma\beta} \left(1 - r^2 \right) \right) \end{aligned}$$

Entropy increase:

Pressure increase:

r is reconnection rate

=> Local entropy can increase significantly **only** for very low plasma β.

Otto, 2009









Heating in Reconnection Jets



Drake et al., 2009 $T_{\parallel} = m_i v_0^2 \frac{B_{0x}^2}{B_0^2}$ $T_{\perp} = \frac{1}{2} m_i v_0^2 \frac{B_{0z}^2}{B_0^2}$ $T = (T_{\parallel} + 2T_{\perp})/3 = \frac{1}{3} m_i v_0^2$

Slow Shock Limit $\Delta n = \frac{3}{2}n_0 \quad \Delta T_p = \frac{1}{5}m_p c_A^2$





KAWs Heat Particles at a Slow Shock

- Dispersive KAWs develop in the upstream region $(\beta_i = \beta_e = 0.1)$
- Develop from backstreaming ions
- Electrons and ions are heating in the parallel direction

Yin et al., 2007





Constraints on Plasma Entry

- Dawn-dusk asymmetries
- Phase space density
- Entropy
- Ion to electron temperature ratio





Electron to Ion Temperature Ratio







Ti > 1 keV Te > 0.1 keV 0.1 < Te/Ti < 0.3

Dawn-dusk asym. Te/Ti lower pre-midnight

Ti < 1, Te < 0.1 keV Near the flanks Te/Ti extends higher than 0.3

Dawn-dusk asym. Te > 1 keV Near Earth postmidnight





Turbulent vs Convective Transport





Turbulent flows in the tail are often much stronger than average flows



2 hour interval, from J. Borovsky 2004







N and T difference between N and S IMF

More cold and dense plasma during N IMF

Colder and denser near the flanks





Simulate drift and diffusion of particles from tail and flank

Filling of the Plasma Sheet



Southward to Northward IMF





Wang, 2009

Some Final Challenges

- A serious challenge for the future is to understand the role of entropy in the formation of the plasma sheet
 - How does it increase by orders of magnitude?
 - Can it help identify transport paths?
 - What is the role of turbulence in changing entropy?
 - What role does it play in transport of plasma to the center of the plasma sheet (interchange)?
- What is the role of entropy in plasma sheet transport
 - Is it a good constraint for slowly evolving plasma sheet?
 - Can it help explain formation of thin current sheets?
 - What changes occur during substorms?
 - Pressure inconsistency?
- Another challenge is to understand why the temperature ratio is preserved from the sheath to plasma sheet
 - It is not required by force balance
 - Is the plasma sheet heating mechanism consistent











